

# *The Application of Best Practices to Unmanned Spacecraft Development*

*An Exploration of Success and Failure in Recent Missions*

*Liam Sarsfield*



Government Distribution Only

**National Security Research Division**

## PREFACE

This documented briefing summarizes research into recent trends in the development of space systems, with emphasis on the reemergence of small spacecraft. The report takes a broad look at some of the initiatives that have been undertaken to reduce the cost and increase the performance of spacecraft. The findings suggest that small spacecraft have intrinsic value and provide government and commercial firms with flexible options for meeting mission needs quickly and effectively. Beyond their intrinsic value, however, small systems remain very complex and for this reason incur a premium price. Additionally, many of the initiatives to streamline the management and engineering of space systems have actually increased risk disproportionately to savings. The documented briefing concludes that efforts to trim cost and schedule from spacecraft projects must be enacted with great care. Initiatives promising to increase performance and reduce cost and risk are emphasized in the document, and recommendations are provided.

The research grew out of previous RAND research on small spacecraft, as well as on trends in defense acquisition reform. The insights presented in this document are related to many elements of current civil and military space policy and should be of interest to government officials in oversight and policy positions. It is also hoped that the report will serve as a useful reference for program officials charged with implementing future space missions.

This study was conducted at the request of the National Reconnaissance Office (NRO). The research was accomplished in the Acquisition and Technology Policy Center of RAND's National Security Research Division.



# CONTENTS

Preface.....	iii
Acknowledgments.....	ix
Abbreviations.....	xi
1. INTRODUCTION.....	1
Study Scope, Objective, and Purpose .....	3
Mission Set and Relevance to NRO.....	5
Study Methodology.....	7
2. TRENDS AND OVERARCHING OBSERVATIONS .....	9
The Influence of Megatrends and the need for Metrics.....	10
In Space, the Commercial Cure MIGHT Be A Placebo .....	12
Successful Programs Dampen the Roller Coaster .....	14
3. FASTER, BETTER, CHEAPER AND COMMERCIAL BEST PRACTICE .....	17
Comparing Commercial and DoD Practices.....	18
The Challenge of Evaluating “Best” Practices.....	21
Evaluating FBC as a Test Case .....	23
Are Today’s Space Missions Faster and Cheaper?.....	25
The “Better” Aspect of FBC.....	27
Recent Successes and Failures – A Look at NASA.....	29
The Reasons for Failures Must be Studied in Detail.....	31
4. ASSESSMENT OF FAILURE TRENDS.....	33
The Top Ten Sources of Failure.....	35
Sloganeering Versus Engineering.....	38
Unmeasured Process Reduction.....	40
Inappropriate Program-Risk Goals .....	43
Failure to Benchmark Against Past Programs.....	46
Failure to HEED PAST Lessons.....	48
Lack of Personnel and Understaffing.....	50
Lack of Design Robustness .....	52
Combining High Risk with Aggressive Cost .....	54
Underestimating Complexity .....	57
Underestimating the Risk of New Technologies .....	59

Poor Progress Metrics and Rework Monitoring.....	61
Lack of Faith in Quantitative Risk Assessment.....	63
Not Accounting for Concurrency in Development.....	65
Relaxed Formality of Technical Reviews.....	67
Failure to Evaluate Unique Software Challenges.....	69
5. SUMMARY OF LESSONS LEARNED .....	71
Risk Management .....	72
Make Risk Management a High Priority .....	75
Recognize Risk Management as a Six-Step Process.....	77
Establish Standards for Risk Methods.....	80
Currently Available Risk Tools .....	82
Risk Is More Than a Project Function.....	83
Engineering Practices.....	85
Careful Application of Design Tools Reduces Risk.....	87
Commitment to a Mission Should Not Be Rushed.....	90
Alternative Development Are Models Not Yet Mature.....	92
Monitor Software Complexity and Tie to Reserves .....	95
Follow Top Three Rules for Staffing a Software Team.....	97
Opportunity Exists in Common Systems.....	99
Acquisition Practices.....	102
The Impact of Acquisition Reform.....	103
New Systems Remain a Challenge .....	106
AR Should Be Cautiously Applied to Space Systems.....	108
Streamline Cost Evaluation Processes .....	110
Stimulate Development of Refined Cost Models.....	113
Link Incentive and Reserves to Risk-Based Budgeting.....	115
Ensure That Cost-Control Efforts Do Not Sacrifice Quality.....	118
Decide on Value Criteria Up Front.....	119
Develop Key Measurement Parameters .....	121
Exploit Fast-Track Procurements.....	125
Exploit Fast-Track Procurements (cont.).....	127
Some Additional Acquisition Lessons Learned.....	128
Maturing and Integrating New Technology.....	130
Close the Gap Between Two Technology Cultures.....	131
Evaluate the Sufficiency of Technology Investments.....	134
Speed the Development of Methods to Measure Maturity.....	137
Avoid the Technology-Maturation Slump .....	139
Expensive Technology Demos Should Be Avoided.....	141

Achieving Mission Success.....	143
Define the Meaning of “Mission Success”.....	144
Optimize Return Through Use of Risk.....	147
Manage a Mission Portfolio.....	149
Link Portfolio Management with Process Improvement.....	152
Broaden and Strengthen the MA Function.....	154
Recognize Reviews as a Critical Element of Success.....	156
Validate Mission Plans Using Up-Front Assessment.....	158
Perform Focused Independent Technical Reviews.....	160
Recognize the Critical Importance of Staff.....	163
6. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	165
Conclusions.....	165
Recommendations.....	168
Planning and Risk Management.....	169
Technology Planning and Implementation.....	170
Engineering and Management Practices.....	171
Appendix A: STRUCTURED INTERVIEW WORKSHEET.....	173
Appendix B: WORKSHOP SUMMARY.....	179
Appendix C: DEFINITION OF NASA FBC MISSIONS.....	185
Appendix D. RELEVANT WORLD WIDE WEB LINKS.....	187
Bibliography.....	195



## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The author is deeply grateful to Commander Wendy Lawrence of the National Reconnaissance Office. This study could not have been completed without her patient support, insight, and encouragement. The analysis cut across many technical disciplines and organizations, and the author would like to express appreciation to the many individuals in government, industry, and academia who took time to meet and discuss their various programs. Special thanks go to Anthony Spear, the force behind the successful Mars Pathfinder mission, for his observations on successful practices, and for many candid discussions on the management of space projects. A note of appreciation goes to David Bearden and William Tosney of The Aerospace Corporation for their observations regarding recent space missions. I also wish to express my gratitude to those who participated in a workshop held during the course of this study to discuss new business practices. The study's objectives were advanced greatly by the willingness of workshop participants to share their experiences openly. The author, of course, remains responsible for any errors in fact or interpretation.

I am indebted to RAND colleagues Scott Pace, Kevin O'Connell, and James Dryden, who provided thoughtful reviews of the draft report. The RAND support staff underpins the development of RAND studies and reports, and I thank the members who contributed to the final report. Marian Branch of the RAND publication staff tirelessly edited the final manuscript, and Darlette Gayle and Kareema Haskins patiently assembled the bibliography.